Fertile Question: Where do I draw the line?

ASSESSMENT GUIDE

The assessment item for this unit is designed to provide students with an opportunity to answer the fertile question: Where do I draw the line? This item will allow students to demonstrate the three equally weighted exit criteria found in section 8.4 of the SAS Religion and Ethics document, Knowledge and Understanding, Processing Skills and Communication Skills. One suggested assessment item for students to demonstrate these criteria and answer the fertile question is given here. Other suggestions can be found in the SAS Religion and Ethics document. Remember, you must submit your own study plan for approval to the Queensland Studies Authority.

Teachers: You may want to preview an episode of Q&A or Can of Worms before introducing this assessment task.

TASK: Construct a hypothetical Q&A style panel to examine a contemporary ethical issue from multiple perspectives and to determine where you would draw the line on the issue. (Q&A is a panel discussion program on ABC television. A group of interested stakeholders and/or experts representing multiple perspectives on an area of interest is gathered to be questioned by audience members).

Suggested process:

1. Review the activities completed in the unit that assisted your understanding of ethics and morality.

2. Choose a contemporary issue that raises ethical questions for you. Some examples include: off-shore processing of refugees, cyber bullying, drugs in sport, a bio-medical issue, carbon pricing, smacking children, the treatment of Australian livestock in overseas abattoirs, banning of social media in schools, illegal downloading from the internet, mining of uranium, alcohol bans for Aboriginal communities etc.

3. Use the See, Judge, Act framework to assist you with your research, to identify key stakeholders and key ethical issues.

4. Identify two to four members for a virtual Q&A program. The panel must include at least the following: a religious perspective, a utilitarian or Kantian perspective, and then other relevant experts or stakeholders. For example, an environmental issue might be discussed by scientists, Aboriginal or Torres Strait Islander people and economic experts.

5. Construct an audience question based around the ethical issues that you identified in your research. Make the questions broad to allow for a variety of perspectives.

   For example: What actual harm is being done by ….. to ……?

   What will be the consequences if ……. isn’t stopped/changed?
Fertile Question: *Where do I draw the line?*

**ASSESSMENT GUIDE**

**TEACHERS**

1. Teachers: You may want to view an episode of Q&A or Can of Worms before introducing this assessment task.

2. Criteria for marking can be found in the QSA SAS document on page 79.

**STUDENTS**

6. Research the answers to the audience question from the perspective of each of the panel members. Ask yourself, for example, how would a Catholic priest/person of religious faith answer this?

   Useful sites to gain credible opinions: Eureka Street, ABC News, The Drum, Applied Ethics.

7. Create a Voki (1-2 mins) for each of the panel members to present their points of view.

8. Create a Stixy page on which to embed the Vokis to present the diverse opinions of the virtual Q&A panel.

9. Finally, having considered the multiple perspectives on this issue, create a Voki that represents your position, where you would draw the line and why.

   For example:

   On the issue of illegal downloading from the internet, having considered the Kantian question of *What if everyone did this*, I would do it, but I would draw the line by not sharing the download with others, and I would make sure the industry didn’t suffer by purchasing the product legally when it became available. My reasons for this position are ….. etc.
See, Judge, Act model for inquiry including some possible inquiry questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name the ethical issue</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Step One: See  Acquisition of Information**

Gather facts: spiritual, psychological, emotional, medical, legal, family views

Possible questions:

- What’s going on?
- What do you see/observe?
- What facts do you know about the issue?
- What did you learn? Who are the key stakeholders on this issue? What are the ethical questions surrounding this issue?
- How do you feel about the issue or experience?

**Step Two: Judge**

**a. Social Analysis**

Determine motives, prioritise values, principles, prima facie duties.

Consider the various courses of action, risks and benefits, short and long term consequences.


**Political factors:** Who decides? Who are they deciding for? How do decisions get made? Who is left out of the decision-making?

**Social factors:** Who is left out? Who is included? Why?

**Historical factors:** What past events influence the situation today?

**Cultural factors:** What values are evident? What do people believe in? Who influences what they believe?

**b. Theological Reflection**

What scriptural passages can help to interpret this? What does Catholic social teaching say about the issue?

**Information + analysis + theological reflection = Step Three: Action**

What needs to be done to change and address root causes in light of human rights, theology and facts? How would you transform current structures/practices/relationships? How would you develop responses/actions with the people at the centre of the injustice? How could you act to empower the disadvantaged? How will you evaluate your action? Where would you draw the line on this issue?